International Conference Quality and Equity in Education: Theories, Applications and Potentials



Organized under the ERASMUS+ KA2 project entitled "Promoting Quality and Equity: A Dynamic Approach to School Improvement (PROMQE)"

May 19, 2017

University of Cyprus, University House "Anastasios G. Leventis",

Seminar Room B108, Nicosia





SYMPOSIUM

PROMOTING QUALITY AND EQUITY: A EUROPEAN EXPERIMENTAL STUDY







Lessons Learnt from the European Study



Anastasia Panayiotou¹, Panayiotis Antoniou², Andria Dimosthenous¹, Elena Kokkinou¹, Catherine Merrigan³, George Pasias⁴, Asimina Ralli⁴

¹Department of Education, University of Cyprus, Cyprus, ² University of Cambridge, UK, ³ School of Education, University College Dublin, Ireland, Faculty of Education, ⁴Faculty of Philosophy, Pedagogy and Psychology, National and Kapodistrian University of Athens, Greece

Step 1:

- To measure the impact of DASI on promoting: *Quality* (increasing student achievement in Mathematics).
- Multilevel analyses were conducted to determine whether students of the experimental group had a greater progress than the control group



Table 1: Parameter estimates and (standard errors) for the analysis of mathematics achievement (students within classes, within schools)

Factors	Model 0	Model 1	Model 2	
Fixed part				
Intercept	0.77 (.04)	0.73 (.07)	0.69 (.05)	
Student level				
Prior achievement		0.57 (.01)	0.57 (.01)	
Gender (0=boy, 1=girl)		-0.07 (.02)	-0.07 (.03)	
SES		0.18 (.02)	0.18 (.02)	
Class level				
Average prior achievement		0.07 (.04)*	0.06 (.04)*	
School level				
Average prior achievement		0.28 (.09)	0.21 (.09)	
DASI (0=control, 1=experimental)			0.19 (.05)	
Countries				
Greece		-0.11 (.11)*	-0.10 (.11)*	
England		0.29 (.11)	0.28 (.12)	
Ireland		-0.13 (.09)*	-0.12 (.08)*	
Variance components				
School	16.3 %	10.5 %	6.1 %	
Class	23.5 %	17.3 %	13.2 %	
Student	60.2 %	35.3 %	35.1 %	
Explained		36.9 %	45.6 %	
Significant test				
X^2	17936	13794	13768	
Reduction		4142	26	
Degrees of freedom		5**	1	
p-value		.000	.000	

* Non statistically significant effect at .05 level

Step 2: Examine whether DASI can be used equally effectively in the four participating countries

Table 2: Effect of using the DASI approach on student achievement gains in mathematics

Country	Effect	Pooled SD	Cohen's d
Cyprus	0.24	0.73	0.33
Greece	0.28	0.67	0.42
England	0.16	0.71	0.23
Ireland	0.32	0.84	0.38
Across countries	0.19	0.62	0.31

Step 3:

• To measure the impact of DASI on promoting: *Equity* (reducing the impact of SES on student achievement).

 Multilevel analyses were conducted to examine the impact of SES on student achievement before and after the implementation of DASI in both groups (i.e., experimental and control) Table 3: Parameter Estimates and (Standard Errors) for the analysis of the impact of SES on student achievement in mathematics (students within classrooms within schools)

Pre-measurePost-measurePre-measurePost-measureFixed partIntercept $0.70 (.12)$ $0.73 (.07)$ $0.67 (.11)$ $0.74 (.07)$ Student levelPrior achievementNA* $0.55 (.01)$ NA* $0.59 (.02)$ Gender (0=boy, 1=girl) $-0.08 (.03)$ $-0.07 (.03)$ $-0.09 (.04)$ $-0.08 (.03)$ SES $0.30 (.00)$ $0.11 (.02)$ $0.28 (.00)$ $0.23 (.02)$ Class level $0.30 (.00)$ $0.11 (.02)$ $0.28 (.00)$ $0.23 (.02)$ Average prior achievementNA* $0.09 (.04)$ NA* $0.08 (.03)$ School level $NA*$ $0.24 (.08)$ NA* $0.18 (.08)$ Countries $Countries$ $Countries$ $Countries$ $Countries$ Greece $-0.13 (.12)^{**}$ $-0.14 (.10)^{*}$ $-0.14 (.11)^{**}$ $-0.11 (.09)^{*}$ England $-0.05 (.11)^{**}$ $0.29 (.10)$ $-0.04 (.10)^{**}$ $0.28 (.10)$ Ireland $0.31 (.13)$ $-0.14 (.08)^{*}$ $0.35 (.12)$ $-0.15 (.09)^{*}$ Variance componentsStudent 42.5% 35.0% 41.8% 34.1% School 13.2% 10.2% 14.8% 10.9% Class 24.7% 17.1% 25.6% 17.5% Student 42.5% 35.0% 41.8% 34.1% Explained 19.6% 37.7% 17.8% 37.5% Significant test X^2 11878 13892 10098 12144 Reduction 231.9 571.9 18	Factors	Experime	Experimental Group		Control Group	
Fixed part Intercept $0.70 (.12)$ $0.73 (.07)$ $0.67 (.11)$ $0.74 (.07)$ Student level Prior achievement NA* $0.55 (.01)$ NA* $0.59 (.02)$ Gender (0=boy, 1=girl) $-0.08 (.03)$ $-0.07 (.03)$ $-0.09 (.04)$ $-0.08 (.03)$ SES $0.30 (.00)$ $0.11 (.02)$ $0.28 (.00)$ $0.23 (.02)$ Average prior achievement NA* $0.09 (.04)$ NA* $0.08 (.03)$ School level Average prior achievement NA* $0.09 (.04)$ NA* $0.08 (.03)$ Greece $-0.13 (.12)$ ** $-0.14 (.10)$ * $-0.14 (.11)$ ** $-0.11 (.09)$ England $-0.05 (.11)$ ** $0.29 (.10)$ $-0.04 (.10)$ ** $0.28 (.10)$ Ireland $0.31 (.13)$ $-0.14 (.08)$ * $0.35 (.12)$ $-0.15 (.09)$ Variance components School 13.2% 10.2% 14.8% 10.9% Class 24.7% 17.1% 25.6% 17.5% Student 42.5% 35.0% 41.8% <t< th=""><th></th><th>Pre-measure</th><th>Post-measure</th><th>Pre-measure</th><th>Post-measure</th></t<>		Pre-measure	Post-measure	Pre-measure	Post-measure	
Intercept $0.70 (.12)$ $0.73 (.07)$ $0.67 (.11)$ $0.74 (.07)$ Student level Prior achievement NA* $0.55 (.01)$ NA* $0.59 (.02)$ Gender (0=boy, 1=girl) $-0.08 (.03)$ $-0.07 (.03)$ $-0.09 (.04)$ $-0.08 (.03)$ SES $0.30 (.00)$ $0.11 (.02)$ $0.28 (.00)$ $0.23 (.02)$ Average prior achievement NA* $0.09 (.04)$ NA* $0.08 (.03)$ School level NA* $0.09 (.04)$ NA* $0.08 (.03)$ Average prior achievement NA* $0.09 (.04)$ NA* $0.08 (.03)$ School level NA* $0.24 (.08)$ NA* $0.18 (.08)$ Countries Greece $-0.13 (.12)^{**}$ $-0.14 (.10)^*$ $-0.14 (.11)^{**}$ $-0.11 (.09)^*$ England $-0.05 (.11)^{**}$ $0.29 (.10)$ $-0.04 (.10)^{**}$ $0.28 (.10)$ Ireland $0.31 (.13)$ $-0.14 (.08)^*$ $0.35 (.12)$ $-0.15 (.09)^*$ Variance components Student 42.5% 35.0% 41.8% 3	Fixed part					
Student level NA* $0.55 (.01)$ NA* $0.59 (.02)$ Gender (0=boy, 1=girl) $-0.08 (.03)$ $-0.07 (.03)$ $-0.09 (.04)$ $-0.08 (.03)$ SES $0.30 (.00)$ $0.11 (.02)$ $0.28 (.00)$ $0.23 (.02)$ Class level NA* $0.09 (.04)$ NA* $0.08 (.03)$ Average prior achievement NA* $0.09 (.04)$ NA* $0.23 (.02)$ Average prior achievement NA* $0.09 (.04)$ NA* $0.08 (.03)$ School level Average prior achievement NA* $0.24 (.08)$ NA* $0.18 (.08)$ Countries Greece $-0.13 (.12)^{**}$ $-0.14 (.10)^*$ $-0.14 (.11)^{**}$ $-0.11 (.09)^*$ England $-0.05 (.11)^{**}$ $0.29 (.10)$ $-0.04 (.10)^{**}$ $0.28 (.10)$ Ireland $0.31 (.13)$ $-0.14 (.08)^*$ $0.35 (.12)$ $-0.15 (.09)^*$ Variance components School 13.2 % 10.2 % 14.8 % 10.9 % Class 24.7 % 17.1 % 25.6 % 17.5 % Signif	Intercept	0.70 (.12)	0.73 (.07)	0.67 (.11)	0.74 (.07)	
Prior achievementNA* $0.55(.01)$ NA* $0.59(.02)$ Gender (0=boy, 1=girl) $-0.08(.03)$ $-0.07(.03)$ $-0.09(.04)$ $-0.08(.03)$ SES $0.30(.00)$ $0.11(.02)$ $0.28(.00)$ $0.23(.02)$ Class levelNA* $0.09(.04)$ NA* $0.08(.03)$ Average prior achievementNA* $0.09(.04)$ NA* $0.08(.03)$ School level </td <td>Student level</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>	Student level					
Gender (0=boy, 1=girl) $-0.08 (.03)$ $-0.07 (.03)$ $-0.09 (.04)$ $-0.08 (.03)$ SES $0.30 (.00)$ $0.11 (.02)$ $0.28 (.00)$ $0.23 (.02)$ Class levelNA* $0.09 (.04)$ NA* $0.08 (.03)$ Average prior achievementNA* $0.09 (.04)$ NA* $0.08 (.03)$ School levelNA* $0.09 (.04)$ NA* $0.08 (.03)$ Average prior achievementNA* $0.24 (.08)$ NA* $0.18 (.08)$ CountriesGreece $-0.13 (.12)^{**}$ $-0.14 (.10)^*$ $-0.14 (.11)^{**}$ $-0.11 (.09)^*$ England $-0.05 (.11)^{**}$ $0.29 (.10)$ $-0.04 (.10)^{**}$ $0.28 (.10)$ Ireland $0.31 (.13)$ $-0.14 (.08)^*$ $0.35 (.12)$ $-0.15 (.09)^*$ Variance componentsSchool 13.2% 10.2% 14.8% 10.9% School 13.2% 10.2% 14.8% 34.1% Explained 19.6% 37.7% 17.8% 37.5% Significant testX² 11878 13892 10098 12144 Reduction 231.9 571.9 182.4 504.2 Degrees of freedom*** 3 6 3 6	Prior achievement	NA*	0.55 (.01)	NA*	0.59 (.02)	
SES Class level $0.30 (.00)$ $0.11 (.02)$ $0.28 (.00)$ $0.23 (.02)$ Average prior achievementNA* $0.09 (.04)$ NA* $0.08 (.03)$ School level </td <td>Gender (0=boy, 1=girl)</td> <td>-0.08 (.03)</td> <td>-0.07 (.03)</td> <td>-0.09 (.04)</td> <td>-0.08 (.03)</td>	Gender (0=boy, 1=girl)	-0.08 (.03)	-0.07 (.03)	-0.09 (.04)	-0.08 (.03)	
Average prior achievement NA^* $0.09 (.04)$ NA^* $0.08 (.03)$ School levelNA* $0.24 (.08)$ NA* $0.18 (.08)$ Average prior achievement NA^* $0.24 (.08)$ NA* $0.18 (.09)$ CountriesSchool $Countries$ School $CountriesGreece-0.13 (.12)^{**}-0.14 (.10)^*-0.14 (.11)^{**}-0.11 (.09)^*England-0.05 (.11)^{**}0.29 (.10)-0.04 (.10)^{**}0.28 (.10)Ireland0.31 (.13)-0.14 (.08)^*0.35 (.12)-0.15 (.09)^*Variance componentsSchool13.2 \%10.2 \%14.8 \%10.9 \%School13.2 \%10.2 \%14.8 \%10.9 \%Class24.7 \%17.1 \%25.6 \%17.5 \%Student42.5 \%35.0 \%41.8 \%34.1 \%Explained19.6 \%37.7 \%17.8 \%37.5 \%Significant testX²11878138921009812144Reduction231.9571.9182.4504.2Degrees of freedom***3636$	SES Class level	0.30 (.00)	0.11 (.02)	0.28 (.00)	0.23 (.02)	
School level Average prior achievement NA* $0.24 (.08)$ NA* $0.18 (.08)$ Countries Greece $-0.13 (.12)^{**}$ $-0.14 (.10)^*$ $-0.14 (.11)^{**}$ $-0.11 (.09)^*$ England $-0.05 (.11)^{**}$ $0.29 (.10)$ $-0.04 (.10)^{**}$ $0.28 (.10)$ Ireland $0.31 (.13)$ $-0.14 (.08)^*$ $0.35 (.12)$ $-0.15 (.09)^*$ Variance components School 13.2% 10.2% 14.8% 10.9% Class 24.7% 17.1% 25.6% 17.5% Student 42.5% 35.0% 41.8% 34.1% Explained 19.6% 37.7% 17.8% 37.5% Significant test X ² 11878 13892 10098 12144 Reduction 231.9 571.9 182.4 504.2 Degrees of freedom*** 3 6 3 6	Average prior achievement	NA*	0.09 (.04)	NA*	0.08 (.03)	
Average prior achievementNA* $0.24 (.08)$ NA* $0.18 (.08)$ CountriesGreece $-0.13 (.12)^{**}$ $-0.14 (.10)^*$ $-0.14 (.11)^{**}$ $-0.11 (.09)^*$ England $-0.05 (.11)^{**}$ $0.29 (.10)$ $-0.04 (.10)^{**}$ $0.28 (.10)$ Ireland $0.31 (.13)$ $-0.14 (.08)^*$ $0.35 (.12)$ $-0.15 (.09)^*$ Variance componentsVariance componentsVariance componentsVariance componentsSchool 13.2% 10.2% 14.8% 10.9% Class 24.7% 17.1% 25.6% 17.5% Student 42.5% 35.0% 41.8% 34.1% Explained 19.6% 37.7% 17.8% 37.5% Significant testVariance componentsVariance componentsVariance componentsSchool 13.2% 10.2% 14.8% 34.1% Class 24.7% 37.7% 17.8% 37.5% Student 42.5% 35.0% 41.8% 34.1% Explained 19.6% 37.7% 17.8% 37.5% Degrees of freedom*** 3 6 3 6 p-value $.001$ $.001$ $.001$ $.001$	School level					
CountriesGreece $-0.13 (.12)^{**}$ $-0.14 (.10)^{*}$ $-0.14 (.11)^{**}$ $-0.11 (.09)^{**}$ England $-0.05 (.11)^{**}$ $0.29 (.10)$ $-0.04 (.10)^{**}$ $0.28 (.10)$ Ireland $0.31 (.13)$ $-0.14 (.08)^{*}$ $0.35 (.12)$ $-0.15 (.09)^{**}$ Variance components 5 13.2% 10.2% 14.8% 10.9% Class 24.7% 17.1% 25.6% 17.5% Student 42.5% 35.0% 41.8% 34.1% Explained 19.6% 37.7% 17.8% 37.5% Significant test X^2 11878 13892 10098 12144 Reduction 231.9 571.9 182.4 504.2 Degrees of freedom*** 3 6 3 6 p -value $.001$ $.001$ $.001$ $.001$	Average prior achievement	NA*	0.24 (.08)	NA*	0.18 (.08)	
Greece $-0.13 (.12)^{**}$ $-0.14 (.10)^{*}$ $-0.14 (.11)^{**}$ $-0.11 (.09)^{**}$ England $-0.05 (.11)^{**}$ $0.29 (.10)$ $-0.04 (.10)^{**}$ $0.28 (.10)$ Ireland $0.31 (.13)$ $-0.14 (.08)^{*}$ $0.35 (.12)$ $-0.15 (.09)^{**}$ Variance componentsSchool 13.2% 10.2% 14.8% 10.9% Class 24.7% 17.1% 25.6% 17.5% Student 42.5% 35.0% 41.8% 34.1% Explained 19.6% 37.7% 17.8% 37.5% Significant test X^2 11878 13892 10098 12144 Reduction 231.9 571.9 182.4 504.2 Degrees of freedom*** 3 6 3 6 p-value $.001$ $.001$ $.001$ $.001$	<u>Countries</u>					
England $-0.05 (.11)^{**}$ $0.29 (.10)$ $-0.04 (.10)^{**}$ $0.28 (.10)$ Ireland $0.31 (.13)$ $-0.14 (.08)^{*}$ $0.35 (.12)$ $-0.15 (.09)^{**}$ Variance components 13.2% 10.2% 14.8% 10.9% School 13.2% 10.2% 14.8% 10.9% Class 24.7% 17.1% 25.6% 17.5% Student 42.5% 35.0% 41.8% 34.1% Explained 19.6% 37.7% 17.8% 37.5% Significant test X^2 11878 13892 10098 12144 Reduction 231.9 571.9 182.4 504.2 Degrees of freedom*** 3 6 3 6	Greece	-0.13 (.12)**	-0.14 (.10)*	-0.14 (.11)**	-0.11 (.09)*	
Ireland $0.31 (.13)$ $-0.14 (.08)^*$ $0.35 (.12)$ $-0.15 (.09)^*$ Variance componentsSchool 13.2% 10.2% 14.8% 10.9% Class 24.7% 17.1% 25.6% 17.5% Student 42.5% 35.0% 41.8% 34.1% Explained 19.6% 37.7% 17.8% 37.5% Significant test X^2 11878 13892 10098 12144 Reduction 231.9 571.9 182.4 504.2 Degrees of freedom*** 3 6 3 6 p-value $.001$ $.001$ $.001$ $.001$	England	-0.05 (.11)**	0.29 (.10)	-0.04 (.10)**	0.28 (.10)	
Variance componentsSchool 13.2% 10.2% 14.8% 10.9% Class 24.7% 17.1% 25.6% 17.5% Student 42.5% 35.0% 41.8% 34.1% Explained 19.6% 37.7% 17.8% 37.5% Significant testVX ² 11878 13892 10098 12144 Reduction 231.9 571.9 182.4 504.2 Degrees of freedom*** 3 6 3 6	Ireland	0.31 (.13)	-0.14 (.08)*	0.35 (.12)	-0.15 (.09)*	
School 13.2% 10.2% 14.8% 10.9% Class 24.7% 17.1% 25.6% 17.5% Student 42.5% 35.0% 41.8% 34.1% Explained 19.6% 37.7% 17.8% 37.5% Significant test X^2 11878 13892 10098 12144 Reduction 231.9 571.9 182.4 504.2 Degrees of freedom*** 3 6 3 6	Variance components					
$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	School	13.2 %	10.2 %	14.8 %	10.9 %	
Student 42.5% 35.0% 41.8% 34.1% Explained 19.6% 37.7% 17.8% 37.5% Significant test 11878 13892 10098 12144 Reduction 231.9 571.9 182.4 504.2 Degrees of freedom*** 3 6 3 6 p-value $.001$ $.001$ $.001$ $.001$	Class	24.7 %	17.1 %	25.6 %	17.5 %	
Explained19.6 % 37.7% 17.8% 37.5% Significant test11878138921009812144X ² 11878138921009812144Reduction231.9571.9182.4504.2Degrees of freedom***3636p-value.001.001.001.001	Student	42.5 %	35.0 %	41.8 %	34.1 %	
Significant test X^2 11878138921009812144Reduction231.9571.9182.4504.2Degrees of freedom***3636p-value.001.001.001.001	Explained	19.6 %	37.7 %	17.8 %	37.5 %	
X ² 11878 13892 10098 12144 Reduction 231.9 571.9 182.4 504.2 Degrees of freedom*** 3 6 3 6 p-value .001 .001 .001 .001	Significant test					
Reduction 231.9 571.9 182.4 504.2 Degrees of freedom*** 3 6 3 6 p-value .001 .001 .001 .001	X ²	11878	13892	10098	12144	
Degrees of freedom*** 3 6 3 6 p-value .001 .001 .001 .001	Reduction	231.9	571.9	182.4	504.2	
p-value .001 .001 .001 .001	Degrees of freedom***	3	6	3	6	
	p-value	.001	.001	.001	.001	

Measuring the impact of DASI on promoting *Equity:* Main Results

Schools implementing DASI managed to reduce the effect of SES on student achievement in mathematics while for schools of the control group the effect of SES remained the same at the beginning and at the end of the program.

Conclusions

- 1. Schools implementing DASI managed to improve student achievement in mathematics more than schools of the control group.
 - DASI had an impact on the quality dimension
- 2. Small differences in the effect of DASI were observed in the four participating countries.
 - DASI was found to be more effective in some countries than others and this should be further studied.

Conclusions

- 3. The impact of SES was similar at the beginning of the intervention in both, the experimental and control schools.
- At the end of the intervention, the impact of SES on student achievement in mathematics was smaller in schools implementing DASI.
- → It can be argued that DASI had an impact also on the equity dimension

Policy Implications – Questions Raised

- I. What kind of actions and/or policies the state can undertake to promote both quality and equity in schools in Cyprus?
 - Do you consider that policies and/or existing mechanisms (e.g., teacher placements, financial support to schools, provision of learning and other resources, staff training) need to be modified to improve the effectiveness of our education system in terms of the equity dimension?

Policy Implications – Questions Raised

- 2. The study reveals the need to develop policies and actions at the school level aimed at improving the teaching and learning environment of the school.
 - To what extent are our schools ready to undertake this role and how could the Ministry of Education support schools to design, implement and evaluate programs to improve their effectiveness?

Policy Implications – Questions Raised

- 3. What actions can the MoEC, the organized bodies and the research community take in order to move on to a model for designing policies, where each proposed reform will be based on a theoretical framework that is evidence-based and theory-driven?
 - This model suggests that any reform needs to be evaluated to identify its impact on improving the effectiveness of our education system in terms of quality and equity.
 - If you agree with this view, how do you consider that policies aiming to provide equal educational opportunities, such as the Action for School and Social Inclusion (ΔPA.Σ.Ε.), should be evaluated?

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This project, entitled "Promoting Quality and Equity: a dynamic approach to school improvement (PROMQE)" has been funded with support from the European Commission. This publication [communication] reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.





Thank you for your attention!

For more information on this project please contact the coordinator of the project **Prof. Leonidas Kyriakides**

Contact details:

Department of Education, University of Cyprus, P.O. Box 20537, 1678 Nicosia, CYPRUS Tel. 00357-22892947, Fax: 00357-22894488 Email: <u>kyriakid@ucy.ac.cy</u>

And/Or

Visit our project webpage: <u>www.ucy.ac.cy/promqe</u>